Subject: Feedback on Terminal Evaluation

As it is stated on the subject, Comitato International per lo Sviluppo dei Poplio (CISP) in cooperation with Ethiopian Catholic Church Social and Development Coordination office of Adigrat (ECC-SDCOA) and Volontariato per lo Sviluppo (VIS) had implemented projects entitle “Better Life and Protection for Vulnerable Groups to Compact Irregular Migration and Development and Support Action for Preventing Irregular Migration” starting from Mar 1, 2017-Jan 31, 2019 in three woredas of Tigray region.

Following the end of project period, terminal evaluation was conducted in collaboration with Tigray Bureau of Labour and Social Affair’s, Tigray Bureau of Justice and Tigray Bureau of Women Affair’s. Based on the presentations, discussions and field visits, the evaluation team has clearly stated the strengths, limitations, challenges and lessons learnt that put to come up with recommendations.

Therefore attached here with, we are sending 5 copies of summarized feedback of the project terminal evaluation.

Best Regards

Cc
- Tigray Bureau of Labour and Social Affair’s
- Tigray Bureau of Justice
- Tigray Bureau of Women Affair’s

Mekelle

Telephone no. 034-4410517
P.O.BOX 280 Mekelle, Tigray

Fax:034-4410519
e-mail- tigrayaidcord@yahoo.com
1. Introduction

According to the signed Project agreement, Committato Internationale Per Lo Sviluppo Dei Popoli (CISP) and Volontariato Internationale per lo Sviluppo (VIS) in cooperation with Ethiopian Catholic Church Social and Development Commission were implementing projects entitled as “Better Life and Protection for Vulnerable Groups to Compact irregular Migration and Development and Support Action for preventing Irregular Migration” Starting from Mar 1, 2017- Jan 31, 2019 in three woredas of Tigray Region.

The main focus areas of project intervention were Strengthening Vital event registration through Trainings, material supply and technology equipment, Enhancing social reintegration, provision of basic services and improving living condition of the most vulnerable groups at risk of irregular migration and Returnees. To observe and evaluate the one year implemented activities, a team composed from the project agreement signatory regional bureaus was established. In view of this, the team conducted field visits at household level, group level and discussion with relevant stakeholders and directly with project beneficiaries in three selected project intervention woredas. By doing so, the team had stated the strengths, limitations and challenges encountered that put to come up with recommendation that are stated here below all.

2. Objective of the Project

Contribute to the improvement of the living conditions of the most vulnerable ones at risk of irregular migration through increasing food security and Income generating activities.

3. Project Identification/Profile

Name of NGO= Committato Internationale Per Lo Sviluppo Dei Popoli (CISP), Volontariato Internationale per lo Sviluppo (VIS) and Ethiopian Catholic Church Social and Development Commission

Title of the Projects= Better Life and Protection for Vulnerable Groups to Compact irregular Migration and Development and Support Action for preventing Irregular Migration

Project Location= Irob, G/Mekeda, G/Afeshum and S/Ts/Emba

Project Period= Mar 1, 2017- Jan 31, 2019
Scope of the Evaluation = G/Mekeda (zalambesa town-Arat killo and Mibraq-Tshay kebelles), G/Afeshum (Tabia Buket and Tabia Dibla-Seaiet) and S/Ts/Emba (Tabia Saesie-kushet Neokido and Edaga-Hamus town)

Time bound of the Evaluation = Jan 30, 2019- Jan 31, 2019

Name of Signatory Government Offices = Tigray Bureau of Women Affair’s, Tigray Bureau of Justice, Tigray Bureau of Agriculture and Rural Development and Tigray Bureau of Labor and Social Affair’s

Name of Participants (Present signatory Bureau’s representatives)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Name of participant</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Phone number</th>
<th>Signature</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Rigat Kidane</td>
<td>Tigray Bureau of Plan and Finance</td>
<td>0941383290</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Atsede Belay</td>
<td>Tigray Bureau of Plan and Finance</td>
<td>0914014801</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Dehab</td>
<td>Tigray Bureau of Labor and Social Affair’s</td>
<td>0914749090</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Fitsum</td>
<td>Tigray Bureau of Justice</td>
<td>0914199274</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Selam</td>
<td>Tigray Bureau of Women Affair’s</td>
<td>0914032811</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Evaluation Methodology
   - Selecting project areas
   - Referring project terminal report
   - Conducting field visits
   - Interviewing individual target groups
   - Discussion with beneficiary sector offices

5. Major outputs/outcomes of the overall project activities
   - Trainings and awareness creation activities on vital registration were delivered for civil registry officials, health extension workers and development army groups. These supports have improved the vital registration service delivery and the number of people who come to register vital events.
   - Trainings were provided for civil registry officials on digital software for vital registration.
• Office furniture, computer accessories and internet connection service were distributed for regional, woreda and tabia vital registration offices and other partner government offices. These supplies and software system had enabled vital registry offices to improve their registration quality and service delivery system.

• Business skill trainings and startup capital were provided for full and half orphan, vulnerable children through their care takers and for land less youth. The families or care takers and the beneficiary youth had started their own business like petty trade, poultry, Fattening and dairy farm activities which had enable them to get income and improve their living condition.

• Trainings and awareness raising activities were conducted on mental and physical disabilities, OVC management and foster care for labor and social affair’s offices and CCCs. The trained professionals have improved their skill on handling and solving cases of disabled people and orphan and vulnerable children.

• Additional financial support was provided for the land less youth small ruminant cooperatives to construct shed for the livestock. This support had helped the youth not to lose their hope on their business success because of financial shortage.

6. **Strengths**

• Beneficiaries’ interest was respected in choosing what and how much agricultural inputs they needed. In this case, there were some gaps in VIS’s project.

• Vital registration trainings for woreda experts were delivered in TOT format, which is important to sustain the skill transfer.

• The Income generating supports were provided as revolving fund, so that will be essential to extend the beneficiary number and to minimize dependency syndrome.

• The selected beneficiaries are really vulnerable ones which include disabilities beneficiaries and HIV AIDS victims and the selection process was led by JES.

• The saving tradition had initiated through opening bank accounts for beneficiaries.

• Solar panel system had been recruited after to solve the lack of electric city for tabia civil registry offices.
7. Limitations
   - Due to late implementation of certain activities such as the provision of income generating supports, follow up gap had shown for beneficiaries’ technical support.
   - In the VIS project, beneficiaries were not given the opportunity to choose the business sector they prefer to engage in and that can affect the success of the small businesses.
   - Midterm evaluation was not conducted according to the signed project agreement.
   - There was limited integration with woreda plan and finance office.

8. Challenges
   - There was shortage of livestock supply in market for the income generating activities, especially small ruminants.
   - Limited supports and commitments of local government offices, particularly in solving encountered problems and owning the project activities the same to the governmental tasks.
   - Insufficient budget allocation especially to fulfilling required number of technical staff.

Recommendation
   - For those who have no source of income other than the new income generating activities they have started, additional supports like livestock feed provision is necessary to help them to get promising profit as early as possible.
   - Beneficiaries, community and/or government shall have direct financial and other contribution to the project in order to create sense of ownership and sustainability.
   - Prior concern shall be given to scheduled, regular and series follow up system for the most benefit of the beneficiaries and better achievement of the project objectives.
   - Midterm evaluation is preferable than the final one in order to identify problems and solve these immediately.
   - Regional and woreda concerned offices shall strongly support and take the responsibility to achieve the project objectives where there are community benefits.
   - Working together and experience sharing with other NGOs shall be considered because it is an input for effective results.
Name of Interviewed Beneficiaries

1. W/ro Senayt and W/rit Maharit Tesfagaber (Woreda G/Afeshum tabia Buket-Dairy farm and Petty trade Beneficiaries)
2. Ato Aregawi (Woreda G/Afeshum, tabia Dibla-Sieat Chairman-VERA support Beneficiary tabia)
3. W/rit Shewa G/Mickael (Woreda G/Mekeda, Zalambesa town- kebelle Mibraq Tsahay –poultry Beneficiary)
5. W/ro Tsegay Kahsay (Woreda S/Ts/Emba, tabia Saesie, kushet Nekido- poultry Beneficiary)